

CONTENTS

| | |
|---|--------|
| Declaration | i |
| Abstract | iii-iv |
| Acknowledgments | v |
| Contents | vi-ix |
| Figures | x |
| Acronyms | xi |
| Statement by President Mbeki at the Unveiling of the Thokoza Monument | xii |
| Preface | xiii |

PART ONE: Introduction and Methodology

| | |
|--|-----------|
| Chapter One: Introduction | 1 |
| Background..... | 1 |
| Aims and Research Questions | 5 |
| Conceptual Framework | 6 |
| Context in Critical Pragmatism | 8 |
| Outcomes in Critical Pragmatism | 8 |
| Rationality in Critical Pragmatism | 9 |
| Power in Critical Pragmatism | 9 |
| Ethics in Critical Pragmatism | 9 |
| Chapter Outline | 11 |
| Chapter Two: Methodology | 15 |
| Empirical Studies in Planning Theory and the Practice Movement | 16 |
| Theorising Evaluation in Planning | 22 |
| Generalisation in Practice Writing | 29 |
| Research Strategy: Practice Writing through a Case Study | 30 |
| Research Methods | 31 |
| Obtaining Empirical Data | 33 |
| Professional Evaluations of the KSiPP | 33 |
| KSiPP Evaluation: 1999 | 33 |
| A Second Evaluation: 2002 | 36 |
| A Third Evaluation: 2003 | 37 |
| A note on interviewing | 38 |
| Positioning the Researcher | 39 |
| Interpreting the Data | 41 |

PART TWO: Towards an Analytical Framework for Planning Evaluation

| | |
|--|-----------|
| Chapter Three: Philosophical Roots of Critical Pragmatism | 45 |
| Introduction | 45 |
| Introduction to Pragmatism and Critical Theory | 47 |
| Pragmatism and the Critical Critique | 52 |
| Foundations of Pragmatism | 52 |
| Dewey's "Critical" Pragmatism | 54 |
| Pragmatism and Context | 55 |
| The Pragmatist View of Reason and Experience | 56 |
| Dewey, Ethics and Growth | 57 |

| | |
|--|----|
| Power and Deliberation in Pragmatism | 59 |
| Pragmatism and Politics | 60 |
| Limitations of Pragmatism | 61 |
| Critical Theory and its Relationship to Pragmatism | 62 |
| Hostility of Critical Theory toward Pragmatism | 62 |
| Habermas' Communicative Rationality and the Dialogue between Critical Theory and Pragmatism | 64 |
| Gaps in Habermas' Application of Pragmatism | 66 |
| Foucault and the Link between Power and Rationality | 67 |
| Foucault's Pragmatic Leanings | 69 |
| Conclusion: Elements of a Critical Pragmatism | 70 |

| | |
|---|-----------|
| Chapter Four: Critical and Pragmatic Traditions and Critical Pragmatism in Planning Theory | 73 |
| Introduction | 73 |
| The Application of Critical Theory in Planning Thought | 75 |
| Social Mobilisation in Planning Thought | 75 |
| Influences of Habermas and the Centrality of Language on Planning Thought .. | 76 |
| Influences of Foucault on Planning Thought | 82 |
| The Application of Pragmatism in Planning Thought | 85 |
| Influence of Classical Pragmatists (Dewey and James) on Planning Thought | 86 |
| Influences of Contemporary (Linguistic) Pragmatists on Planning Thought | 88 |
| Influence of Contemporary Radical Pragmatism on Planning Thought | 90 |
| Limitations of the Tradition of Pragmatism in Planning | 91 |
| The Ethical Limitation in Critical and Pragmatic Traditions in Planning | 92 |
| Conclusion | 93 |

| | |
|---|-----------|
| Chapter Five: Critical Pragmatism: An Analytical Framework for Examining Planning Practice | 95 |
| Introduction | 95 |
| Definition of Critical Pragmatism | 97 |
| Learning from Critical and Pragmatic Traditions | 98 |
| Lens One: Context in Critical Pragmatism | 100 |
| Lens Two: Outcomes in Critical Pragmatism | 102 |
| Lens Three: Rationality in Critical Pragmatism | 106 |
| Lens Four: Power in Critical Pragmatism | 109 |
| Critical Pragmatism and Structures of Power | 111 |
| Critical Pragmatism and Communication | 111 |
| Critical Pragmatism and Discourse | 112 |
| Lens Five: Ethics in Critical Pragmatism | 113 |
| Conclusion | 117 |

**PART THREE: Application of a Critical Pragmatism Analytical Framework to
Planning Practice**

| | |
|---|------------|
| Chapter Six: Context of the KSIPP | 119 |
| Introduction | 119 |
| Kathorus in the East Rand: A Context of Economic Decline, Political Conflict | 121 |
| Economic Decline in South Africa's Powerhouse | 121 |
| A Context of Multiple Wars | 124 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| The Context of Local Government Transition: Institutional Restructuring, Rivalry and Deliberation | 128 |
| Forums as Seats of Emergent Discourse | 128 |
| Local Level Institutional Restructuring and Rivalry | 132 |
| The Role of Civil Society | 137 |
| Changing Discourses and Planning Thrusts of the New Democratic State | 139 |
| An Agenda for Reconstruction and Development | 140 |
| Shifts from Reconstruction to Growth and from Delivery to Management | 143 |
| Fragmentation and Integration | 148 |
| Key Implementation Focus of Reconstruction and Development: (Visible) Urban Renewal Projects | 153 |
| New Public Management Influences: Pressures for Efficiency, Co-ordination, and Participation | 155 |
| Focus on the Poor | 157 |
| Conclusion | 159 |
| | |
| Chapter Seven: Outcomes of the KSiPP | 161 |
| Introduction | 161 |
| Motivation For A Presidential Project: Violence And Underdevelopment | 163 |
| Institutional Structures of the KSiPP | 164 |
| Peace Structures And The Lead Up To A Kathorus Task Group | 164 |
| Birth of the KSiPP and Immediate Delivery Focus | 166 |
| Multi-level Institutional Arrangements | 168 |
| Strategising and Funding the KSiPP | 172 |
| Simplifying the Complex Problem: A Four-Phase Strategy for Implementation | 172 |
| Financing the KSiPP | 172 |
| Structuring Community Involvement through Development Forums and Action Committees | 173 |
| Project Monitoring | 174 |
| Silo Implementation within a Strong Core | 174 |
| Outcomes in Six Functional Areas | 175 |
| Engineering Services: Large Scale Efficient Delivery at High Speed | 175 |
| Security: Policing, Privatised Security and Communications to Lay Preconditions for Development | 178 |
| Housing: Physical Interventions Ahead of Integration and Equity | 181 |
| Sketch of 'Repair and Redevelopment of Housing Destroyed by Violence' Sub-Project | 182 |
| Failure of other Planned Housing Projects | 185 |
| Social Services: Slow Processes, Weak and Rival Institutions, Meaningful Delivery | 186 |
| General Overview of Social Services Portfolio | 186 |
| Health | 190 |
| Welfare | 191 |
| Education | 193 |
| Sport, Recreation and Business Development | 194 |
| Sport and Recreation | 194 |
| Business Development | 196 |
| Communication | 196 |
| Conclusion | 198 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| Chapter Eight: Analysis of the KSiPP through the Lenses of Critical Pragmatism | 199 |
| Introduction | 199 |
| Context: “The Process and Timing – That Time will Never Come Again...” | 200 |
| Outcomes: “We Were Results Oriented” | 203 |
| Power: Taking liberties in times of crisis | 208 |
| “We Talked Ourselves to Pieces:” | 209 |
| Deliberation in Setting the Preconditions for the KSiPP | 209 |
| Deliberation in Multidimensional Professional Team | 210 |
| Collaboration and Manipulation: “There were liberties we could take in the heat of the battle” | 211 |
| 1) Optimising institutional opportunity | 212 |
| 2) Manipulating and diffusing political power through project interventions | 213 |
| 3) Maintaining local government cooperation | 214 |
| 4) Mediating between consultants and local government | 215 |
| Impact of Institutional Power | 215 |
| 1) Rivalries and tensions in state institutions | 215 |
| 2) Role of civic structures | 218 |
| Power and Participation | 218 |
| 1) Community level engagement | 219 |
| 2) Tension between participation and delivery | 222 |
| 3) Empowerment and dependency | 223 |
| 4) Information sharing and withholding | 224 |
| 5) Inclusion and Exclusion – Power and Alienation | 224 |
| Power of Individual Personalities | 225 |
| Power and Rationality in Political and Technical Approaches | 232 |
| Rationality | 234 |
| Framing Strategy: Getting Buy In through Technical ‘Simplicity’ | 234 |
| Multiple Rationalities | 236 |
| Ethics: “I am not Convinced we Always Addressed the Real Needs” | 240 |
| Project Choice: Expedience over Justice | 240 |
| Masking of Ethical Concerns in Technical Rationality | 243 |
| Spatial Justice | 243 |
| Conclusion | 245 |
| | |
| Chapter Nine: Conclusions | 247 |
| Findings of a Critical Pragmatic Evaluation of the KSiPP | 247 |
| Value and Limitations of Critical Pragmatism as an Analytical Framework for Planning | 258 |
| Method and Problem of Method | 260 |
| Limitations of the Methodology | 262 |
| Concluding Comments | 264 |
| | |
| Appendix One | 266 |
| Appendix Two | 271 |
| Bibliography | 273 |
| List of Interviewees | 294 |